HC-03 Pre-modern medicine's observations of sex difference

Introduction: The Three Layers of Human Sex Difference

The study of how human beings vary by sex is a discipline fraught with profound biological realities and intricate sociopolitical interpretations. For the rigorous analyst examining how couples, families, organisations, and societies can best function together, historical medical paradigms offer a vital window into the human condition. Pre-modern medical systems—ranging from the Graeco-Roman humoral traditions to the Ayurvedic systems of India, the classical texts of Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM), and the scholastic achievements of medieval European and Islamic physicians—did not possess modern endocrinological or genetic tools. Yet, they were keen observers of physiological phenomena, behavioural variations, and reproductive mechanics.

To systematically evaluate pre-modern medicine's observations of sex difference, it is essential to distinguish between three distinct but interacting layers of human reality. The first layer is physiology, representing the measurable biological bedrock. This includes chromosomal configurations, gonadal development, hormonal profiles, skeletal dimorphism, and reproductive mechanics such as menstruation, lactation, and ovulation. The second layer is behaviour, representing the statistical, phenotypic expressions that emerge from physiology interacting with the environment. These traits, which include aggression, risk tolerance, nurturance, and sexual response, exist on overlapping statistical distributions rather than absolute binaries. The third layer is culture, representing the highly variable systems of meaning, belief, metaphor, and social organization that humans build to explain physiology and regulate behaviour.

Pre-modern medicine frequently observed real physiological events—such as the cessation of menses during lactation, or perimenstrual shifts in mood—and accurately mapped subsequent statistical behaviours. However, these systems often erred profoundly at the cultural layer, filtering empirical observations through metaphysical frameworks that conflated statistical averages with absolute, typological categories, frequently to institutionalize social hierarchies. This report provides an exhaustive analysis of how pre-modern systems described sex differences, evaluating the great historiographical controversies surrounding these models, mapping ancient observations to modern endocrinology, and extracting implications for contemporary human organization.

The Graeco-Roman Foundations: Hippocrates, Aristotle, and Galen

The intellectual bedrock of Western, Byzantine, and Islamic medical traditions regarding sex differences was laid in classical antiquity. The classical Greek approach to the sexed body was not monolithic; it contained competing paradigms that struggled to reconcile the undeniable physiological differences in reproduction with broader cosmological philosophies.

Hippocratic Humoralism: The Spongy Flesh and the Necessity of Menses

The *Corpus Hippocraticum*, a diverse collection of medical texts dating primarily from the fifth and fourth centuries BCE, presents a distinctly dimorphic view of human tissue. In gynecological treatises such as *Diseases of Women* (De mulierum affectibus) and *On the Nature of Woman*, the Hippocratic authors posited that male and female bodies differed fundamentally at the level of tissue texture[1]. The female body was described as softer, wetter, and more "spongy" (*chaunos*) or wool-like (*eirion*) compared to the denser, drier male body[4].

This physiological hypothesis served as the central rationale for menstruation. Because female flesh was thought to be spongy and loose-textured, it absorbed excess fluid from the diet at a much higher rate than male flesh[4]. If this fluid was not regularly purged through the menses (*catamenia*), it would accumulate, stagnate, and cause systemic disease[3]. Thus, menstruation was observed as a critical, sex-specific homeostatic mechanism[4]. Furthermore, Hippocratic medicine recognized that pregnancy resolved the accumulation of this fluid, as the excess blood was diverted to nourish the growing fetus, and later converted into breast milk[4].

While the Hippocratic texts recognized profound physiological differences that extended beyond the genitalia into every part of the flesh, they culturally framed the female body as inherently pathological or perpetually on the verge of humoral imbalance if not anchored by regular reproductive events[1]. The pharmacological management of these conditions often relied on a vast array of botanical and mineral recipes. Some treatises utilized luxury ingredients indicative of elite medical practice, while others incorporated "dirt" or excrement to draw out foul humors, reflecting a cultural ambiguity about the purity of the female reproductive system[1].

Aristotelian Hylomorphism: Form and Matter in Generation

Where the Hippocratic writers were primarily empirical physicians, Aristotle approached sex difference as a philosopher and biologist. In his foundational text *Generation of Animals* (*De Generatione Animalium*), Aristotle sought to explain the mechanics of heredity and reproduction by rejecting earlier pangenesis theories (which posited that seed was drawn from all parts of the body)[8]. Instead, he developed a one-seed theory of reproduction based on his broader philosophical framework of hylomorphism, the doctrine that physical objects result from the combination of matter and form[11].

According to Aristotle, the male and female contributions to generation are fundamentally asymmetrical. The male provides the semen, which carries the *pneuma* (vital breath or heat) and acts as the "formal" and "efficient" cause of the offspring[11]. The semen imparts the "form" or blueprint of the human being, transferring the sensitive soul, but it contributes no physical material to the embryo, evaporating after conception[14]. The female, conversely, provides the *catamenia* (menstrual blood), which serves as the "material" cause—the inert, unformed matter out of which the fetus is constructed[8]. Aristotle famously compared this process to a carpenter (the male form) shaping wood (the female matter), or rennet curdling milk to make cheese[11].

Aristotle attributed this fundamental reproductive asymmetry to vital heat. The male possesses superior vital heat, allowing him to "concoct" or refine his blood into pure, concentrated semen[14].

The female, being naturally colder and more abundant in unconcocted blood, cannot complete this concoction, leaving her generative contribution as unrefined menstrual matter[14]. In Aristotle's typological view, the female was effectively an "infertile male" or a departure from the male physiological ideal, caused by a failure to generate sufficient heat during fetal development[14]. He explicitly argued against pre-Socratic thinkers like Empedocles and Democritus, who suggested that sex was determined by the heat of the uterus or whether the seed came from the right or left side of the body, maintaining instead that the formal nature of the male seed dictates the outcome[14].

Galen's Synthesis and the Two-Seed Theory

In the second century CE, the physician Galen of Pergamon synthesized Hippocratic and Aristotelian thought while introducing significant anatomical corrections based on animal dissection. Most notably, in works such as *On Semen* and *On the Usefulness of the Parts of the Body*, Galen rejected Aristotle's one-seed theory in favour of a two-seed theory[17].

Galen argued that both males and females produce seed (semen) necessary for conception, asserting that the female testes (ovaries) also secrete a seminal fluid[17]. However, attempting to reconcile his clinical observations with Aristotelian metaphysics, Galen maintained that the female seed was colder, wetter, and less perfect than the male seed, serving primarily to nourish the male seed rather than dictate the form[17].

Galen's anatomical descriptions proved immensely influential for over a millennium. He famously asked his readers to imagine the male reproductive organs turned inward, suggesting that the female genitalia were an inverted, internal version of the male's—the vagina corresponding to the penis, the uterus to the scrotum, and the ovaries to the testes[20]. This morphological homology was driven by his belief in the teleological perfection of nature; the colder female body lacked the vital heat necessary to thrust the organs outward during fetal development[22].

Feature	Aristotle (Generation of Animals)	Galen (On Semen / Usefulness of Parts)	Hippocratic Corpus (Diseases of Women)
Generative Contribution	Male provides formal/efficient cause (seed); Female provides material cause (menses).	Both sexes provide seed; female seed is colder/imperfect but necessary.	Both sexes contribute to generation; female flesh requires menses to clear excess fluid.
Physiological Driver	Vital heat; male is hotter and can concoct blood into semen.	Vital heat; lack of heat causes female organs to remain internal.	Tissue texture; female flesh is spongy and wet, requiring regular

			purging.
Anatomical Model	Functional asymmetry based on hylomorphism.	Homologous inversion (vagina as inverted penis).	Radical dimorphism in the fundamental texture of the flesh.

The Great Historiographical Controversy: The 'One-Sex' Model on Trial

The interpretation of Graeco-Roman, medieval, and early modern medical texts regarding sex difference became the subject of one of the most intense historiographical controversies of the late 20th and early 21st centuries. The debate centers on how modern scholars interpret the cultural lenses through which pre-modern physicians viewed physiological reality, a debate that heavily influences modern gender studies and the sociology of science.

Thomas Laqueur and the Invention of the Two-Sex Model

In 1990, historian Thomas Laqueur published *Making Sex: Body and Gender from the Greeks to Freud*, a highly influential text proposing that Western medical and philosophical thought underwent a radical epistemological shift in the late 18th century[20].

Laqueur argued that from antiquity until the Enlightenment, Western science operated under a pervasive "one-sex model"[21]. Drawing heavily on Galen's homology of inverted genitalia, Laqueur posited that pre-modern medicine did not view men and women as two distinct, incommensurable sexes. Instead, there was only one sex—the male—arranged on a vertical, metaphysical hierarchy of perfection[20]. Women were simply lesser, colder, inverted versions of men. Physiologically, Laqueur argued, the one-sex model viewed bodily fluids (blood, semen, milk) as fungible and interchangeable, differing only in their degree of concoction or heat, rather than being sex-specific substances[4].

According to Laqueur, the shift to a "two-sex model"—in which male and female biology were seen as radically distinct, opposite, and incommensurable—was not driven by scientific discovery or physiological realities, but by political necessity[20]. As Enlightenment ideals of universal human equality gained traction, traditional social hierarchies could no longer be justified by custom or divine right. Therefore, Laqueur argued, the scientific establishment "invented" profound biological dimorphism to justify the continued exclusion of women from the public sphere, grounding gender hierarchy in immutable nature rather than society[21].

The Empirical Rebuttal: King, Cadden, Park, and Stolberg

While Laqueur's thesis achieved near-canonical status in cultural and literary studies, serving as a foundational text for theories of social constructionism, it was rapidly and systematically dismantled by historians of medicine and science. The leading critics—Katharine Park, Robert Nye, Joan Cadden, Michael Stolberg, and Helen King—demonstrated that Laqueur profoundly misread primary sources, selectively ignored contradictory data, and imposed an artificial,

politically motivated chronology[20].

The empirical rebuttals are clustered around several robust historical findings that reassert the primacy of the physiological layer in pre-modern medicine:

First, Katharine Park and Robert Nye, in their 1991 review "Destiny is Anatomy" published in *The New Republic*, argued that a monolithic one-sex model never existed. They demonstrated that Aristotle, Galen, and early modern anatomists frequently deployed two-sex models when it suited their theoretical needs, and that Laqueur conflated Aristotle's and Galen's distinct theories to create a false impression of a unified ancient consensus[20]. Joan Cadden's *Meanings of Sex Difference in the Middle Ages* (1993) further demonstrated that medieval scholastic medicine, theology, and surgery accommodated multiple, overlapping models of sex difference simultaneously, without requiring a single overarching paradigm to explain human generation and anatomy[21].

Second, Helen King, in *The One-Sex Body on Trial: The Classical and Early Modern Evidence* (2013), argued that Laqueur's obsession with genital homology ignored the broader physiological frameworks of antiquity[21]. The Hippocratic texts explicitly posited a two-sex model based on the radical difference in the texture of male and female flesh (spongy versus dense), which necessitated menstruation[4]. King showed that Laqueur minimized menstruation as a mere "local variant" of generic bodily flux, ignoring its definitional importance to pre-modern female physiology and identity[4].

Third, Michael Stolberg, in his 2003 *Isis* paper "A Woman Down to Her Bones: The Anatomy of Sexual Difference in the Sixteenth and Early Seventeenth Centuries," directly refuted Laqueur's 18th-century timeline[27]. Stolberg presented extensive evidence that leading anatomists established incommensurable physiological differences between the sexes—specifically regarding the skeletal structure and the pelvis—long before the Enlightenment[27]. Visual illustrations of distinctly female skeletons, such as those by Felix Platter (1583) and Caspar Bauhin (1597), emerged around 1600[29]. Stolberg argued that this shift toward highlighting sexual dimorphism was driven by the rise of empirical anatomical observation and the emergence of specialist gynecology, rather than serving as a reactionary political response to Enlightenment feminism[27]. Laqueur responded in the same journal with "Sex in the Flesh" (2003), arguing that early anatomical illustrations still contained traces of the one-sex body and that medical simulators treated the male body as the default, but historians largely view the empirical evidence for early dimorphism as overwhelming[21].

The consensus among rigorous historians of science is that while the cultural metaphors used to describe sex difference evolved, pre-modern medicine always recognized deep, measurable physiological dimorphism. Laqueur's fundamental error was assuming that a culture's use of analogical language (for instance, calling the vagina an inverted penis) equated to an inability to perceive biological reality.

Eastern Medical Traditions: Ayurveda and Traditional Chinese Medicine

Outside the Graeco-Roman sphere, complex medical systems in India and China developed

highly sophisticated frameworks for observing and managing sex differences. These systems prioritized functional physiology, energy dynamics, and the meticulous management of the female reproductive cycle over anatomical homology.

Ayurveda: Doshas, Artava, and the Validation of Ayurgenomics

Ayurveda, the traditional medical system of the Indian subcontinent codified in foundational texts like the *Charaka Samhita* and *Sushruta Samhita*, classifies human physiology and temperament according to three fundamental energies or *doshas*: Vata (ether and air, governing movement), Pitta (fire and water, governing metabolism), and Kapha (earth and water, governing structure)[31]. An individual's unique baseline constitution of these doshas is termed their *Prakriti*, which is determined at conception and remains invariant throughout life[32].

In Ayurvedic gynecology, female physiology revolves around *Artava*, a term denoting both the ovum and menstrual blood. *Artava* is considered an *Upadhatu* (sub-tissue) of *Rasa Dhatu* (plasma or lymph), underscoring the systemic, whole-body nature of the female reproductive cycle rather than isolating it to the reproductive organs[36]. The menstrual cycle itself, termed *Rituchakra*, is divided into three dosha-dominant phases: *Rajahsravakala* (menstruation, Vata-dominant), *Rutukala* (the proliferative and ovulatory phase, Kapha-dominant), and *Rutuvyatitakala* (the secretory phase, Pitta-dominant)[37].

To manage the physiological and behavioural vulnerability of the menstrual phase, Ayurveda developed *Rajaswala Paricharya*, a rigorous cultural, dietary, and lifestyle regimen[31]. Menstruating women were advised to avoid physical exertion, sleep on a darbha grass mat on the floor, consume light, warm diets (specifically barley, ghee, and milk), and observe celibacy (*Brahmacharya*)[31]. They were also instructed to avoid daytime sleep, excessive talking, and crying[31]. While some of these cultural injunctions bordered on ritual purity taboos, the underlying physiological rationale was highly pragmatic: the stabilization of hormonal fluctuations, the mitigation of pelvic congestion (preventing Vata derangement which leads to dysmenorrhea), and the prevention of secondary infections while the uterine lining was sloughed[39].

Fascinatingly, modern precision medicine has begun to validate the physiological reality underlying Ayurvedic observational typologies through the emerging field of Ayurgenomics[32]. Seminal research by Prasher et al. (2008, *PNAS*) demonstrated that extreme *Prakriti* types exhibit distinct genomic, transcriptomic, and biochemical correlates[41]. In a highly rigorous 2015 study published in *Scientific Reports*, researchers screened 10,000 individuals in a genetically homogeneous population in Western India to identify 147 healthy individuals with extreme *Prakriti* phenotypes[35]. Unsupervised clustering of their molecular data revealed three distinct natural clusters corresponding perfectly to Vata, Pitta, and Kapha[35].

Furthermore, specific genetic markers have been linked to these constitutional types. For example, individuals classified as Pitta *Prakriti* exhibit a 2.3-fold higher frequency of rapid metabolizer alleles (such as CYP2C19 variants) and differential expression of the EGLN1 oxygen-sensor gene, which links to hypoxia responsiveness and high-altitude adaptation[42]. Ayurgenomics demonstrates that while the vocabulary of ancient medicine was metaphorical and cultural, it successfully categorized measurable, genetic human variance—the physiological layer—that dictates behaviour, metabolism, and disease susceptibility.

Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM): Sun Simiao and the Roots of Gynecology

In Traditional Chinese Medicine, sex differences were articulated through the cosmological binary of Yin and Yang. Men were associated with Yang (heat, activity, Qi or vital energy), while women were associated with Yin (cold, receptivity, Xue or blood)[45]. Unlike the hierarchical one-sex model of Europe, Yin and Yang were viewed as complementary and mutually necessary for cosmic and bodily harmony, though this framework still operated within a socially patriarchal culture.

The seventh-century Tang dynasty physician Sun Simiao, in his monumental text *Beiji Qianjin Yaofang* (Essential Prescriptions Worth a Thousand Gold, c. 651 CE), took a revolutionary step by establishing women's medicine (*fuke*) as a distinct, separate category at the very beginning of his treatise[45]. Sun Simiao justified this separation on strictly physiological grounds: he observed that women experience menstruation, pregnancy, childbirth, and postpartum recovery, all of which represent massive, sex-specific physiological stressors requiring distinct pharmacological management[45].

TCM emphasized that women's pathology was primarily rooted in Blood (*Xue*) deficiency or stagnation, whereas men's pathology was rooted in Qi. This physiological paradigm led to the development of highly specific herbal formulas aimed at regulating the menstrual cycle. A prime example is *Si Wu Tang* (Four-Agents Decoction), developed to nourish the blood and treat dysmenorrhea, alongside *Gui Zhi Fu Ling Wan* for breaking up blood stasis[47]. Modern systematic reviews and randomized controlled trials (RCTs) have evaluated these traditional formulas for the treatment of primary dysmenorrhea. While reviewers note that the methodological quality of some older trials varies, high-quality RCTs consistently report statistically significant reductions in peak and overall pain compared to placebo, and comparable efficacy to conventional Non-Steroidal Anti-Inflammatory Drugs (NSAIDs) and oral contraceptives, without significant adverse effects[47]. This validates the empirical efficacy of pre-modern Chinese pharmacological observations regarding the female pain response.

Medieval European and Islamic Medicine: Translating and Transforming Gender

During the medieval period, the translation of Greek texts into Arabic, and subsequently from Arabic into Latin, created a vibrant, cosmopolitan medical discourse. Observations of sex difference were heavily debated and refined across the Islamic and Christian worlds, yielding unique insights into the behavioural and physiological layers of human existence.

The School of Salerno and the Trotula

In the 11th and 12th centuries, the medical school at Salerno in southern Italy became a focal point for the synthesis of indigenous European empirical medicine and translated Arabic texts. This environment produced the *Trotula*, the most influential compendium of women's medicine in medieval Europe[49].

Historian Monica Green's rigorous 2002 critical edition of the *Trotula* revealed that it was not a single text by one author, but an assemblage of three distinct treatises, obscuring its origins[49].

The first text, *Liber de sinthomatibus mulierum* (Conditions of Women), was a highly theoretical text written by a male author, heavily reliant on Arabic translations of Galenism and the works of Ibn al-Jazzar. It maintained the Hippocratic view that women's spongy flesh required menstruation to purge excess cold and wet humors, offering precise prescriptions for scanty menses and uterine suffocation[50].

The second text, *De curis mulierum* (Treatments for Women), was authored by a historical female healer named Trota of Salerno[49]. Trota's text is remarkably empirical and pragmatic, showing little concern for humoral theory[49]. She provided practical treatments for female physiological ailments—incontinence, dysmenorrhea, postpartum tearing, and birth control—demonstrating a sophisticated, localized knowledge of female anatomy and reproductive mechanics[51]. The third text, *De ornatu mulierum* (Women's Cosmetics), dealt with skin diseases and beauty regimens[49]. Trota radically challenged contemporary dogma by asserting that infertility could be caused by defects in male seed or delivery as often as by defects in the female womb, representing a major leap in observational reproductive physiology[54].

Hildegard of Bingen: Sexual Pleasure and the 'Phlegmatic' Intersex

In the 12th century, the German abbess and polymath Hildegard of Bingen authored two major medical texts, *Physica* and *Causae et Curae*[55]. Hildegard's observations of sex difference are unique for their synthesis of deep theological speculation with astute physiological and psychological observation.

Hildegard fully acknowledged female sexual pleasure and its role in conception, providing one of the earliest female-authored descriptions of the female orgasm[56]. She conceptualized conception not purely as the imposition of male form on female matter, but as a dynamic interaction where the female's biological heat and pleasure actively drew in and nurtured the seed, effectively enabling conception and valorizing female reproductive agency[13].

Furthermore, Hildegard utilized the four humoral temperaments to explore behavioural and phenotypic variances that defied strict binary categorizations. In *Causae et Curae*, she described four types of men (choleric, sanguine, melancholic, and phlegmatic) and their sexual necessities[58]. She described the "phlegmatic man"—a male with higher bodily moisture, a "womanly-colored face," softer veins, and a gentler disposition[59]. Modern scholars have analyzed Hildegard's phlegmatic man and sanguine woman as early recognitions of what we would now call intersex traits or, more broadly, the overlapping statistical distributions of human endocrinology and behaviour[59]. Hildegard observed that men and women were not absolute, hermetically sealed typologies; varying levels of *viriditas* (greenness or vital energy, acting almost hormonally) created a spectrum of phenotypic expressions that challenged prelapsarian ideals of absolute sexual dimorphism[59].

The Islamic Golden Age: Avicenna and Ibn al-Nafis

In the medieval Islamic world, the preservation and expansion of medical knowledge reached its zenith with figures like Ibn Sina (Avicenna, 980–1037 CE) and Ibn al-Nafis (1213–1288 CE), whose works heavily influenced both Eastern and Western medical thought.

In his monumental *Canon of Medicine* (*Al-Qanun fi al-Tibb*), an immense encyclopedia of

medicine, Avicenna synthesized Aristotelian philosophy with Galenic anatomy, pioneering inductive logic in the diagnosis of syndromes[61]. On the subject of sex difference and generation, Avicenna confirmed the existence of female generative organs and supported the two-seed theory, arguing that women must experience orgasm to release female semen (*mani*)[64]. He adopted Aristotle's metaphor of the male semen acting as rennet to curdle the female semen and blood (the milk), combining the formal and material causes into a sophisticated physiological theory of fertilization[15]. Avicenna also engaged deeply with the psychological and behavioural aspects of sexuality, suggesting that female sexual satisfaction was necessary for the continuation of the family and the prevention of uterine disease[66].

Two centuries later, the Damascene physician Ibn al-Nafis—famous for providing the first description of the pulmonary transit of blood in 1242—wrote a massive commentary on Avicenna's anatomy titled *Sharh tashrih al-qanun li' Ibn Sina*[64]. Ibn al-Nafis critically engaged with the origin of the male and female seed, rejecting Avicenna's assertion that semen was extracted by a specialized generative faculty. Instead, he argued that semen was the residue of the fourth digestion of the generative organs themselves, akin to how milk is the residue of the nourishment of the breasts[64]. This intense debate highlights how Islamic physicians treated the reproductive physiology of both sexes as subjects for rigorous empirical and logical deduction, steadily refining the anatomical understanding of generation apart from pure philosophy.

Anticipating Modern Endocrinology: Triumphs and Errors

Pre-modern medicine lacked the vocabulary of hormones, receptors, and neuroendocrinology. Yet, through rigorous observation over centuries, these systems identified clinical patterns that map perfectly onto modern endocrinological science, alongside several profound errors resulting from cultural biases.

The Triumph of Clinical Observation: PMS and PMDD

Ancient physicians across Greece, India, and the Islamic world noted that women experienced cyclical shifts in mood, physical comfort, and cognition prior to menstruation. Hippocratic texts attributed this to the buildup of heated, turbulent blood seeking an exit[1]; Ayurvedic texts warned of Vata derangement causing anxiety and pain[31].

Modern endocrinology validates these observations as Premenstrual Syndrome (PMS) and its more severe variant, Premenstrual Dysphoric Disorder (PMDD)[70]. The physiological basis of PMS involves the brain's sensitivity to the luteal phase fluctuations of estrogen, progesterone, and allopregnanolone, interacting with the serotonergic system and the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis[70].

A highly rigorous systematic review and meta-analysis by Direkvand-Moghadam et al. (2014) in the *Journal of Clinical and Diagnostic Research* assessed the worldwide epidemiology of PMS[73]. Analyzing 17 studies with a massive aggregate sample size of 18,803 individuals, the researchers found a pooled global prevalence of 47.8% (95% CI: 32.6–62.9) for PMS among women of reproductive age[73]. Interestingly, the meta-analysis revealed massive cultural variance in reporting: prevalence was measured at 12% in France and 98% in Iran[73]. This

variance perfectly illustrates the three-layer model: the underlying *physiology* (luteal hormone fluctuation) is universal; the *behavioural* symptoms are widespread (averaging nearly 50%); but the *culture* dictates how these symptoms are perceived, pathologized, and reported.
Furthermore, modern research in the *Journal of Sex & Marital Therapy* (2017, 2021) highlights the impact of PMDD on female sexual function and relationship distress[71]. Qualitative studies involving 40 women demonstrate highly polarized responses to sexual activity during menstruation, driven by societal attitudes regarding disgust versus pleasure[71]. This validates pre-modern injunctions, such as the Ayurvedic *Rajaswala Paricharya*, which recognized the need to carefully manage interpersonal and sexual dynamics during periods of acute hormonal fluctuation, even if their cultural reasoning relied on purity taboos[40].

Postpartum Physiology and Lactational Amenorrhea

Another triumph of pre-modern observation was the recognition that intense breastfeeding suppressed fertility, a fact utilized for family planning in early Islamic medicine, medieval Europe, and traditional African societies[78].
Modern endocrinology explains this through the Lactational Amenorrhea Method (LAM). Suckling induces the release of beta-endorphins and prolactin, which suppress Gonadotropin-Releasing Hormone (GnRH). This inhibits the release of Luteinizing Hormone (LH) and Follicle-Stimulating Hormone (FSH), thereby preventing ovulation[81].
Cochrane Systematic Reviews (e.g., Van der Wijden et al., 2003) have extensively evaluated LAM. When practiced correctly according to the 1988 Bellagio Consensus—exclusive breastfeeding on demand, with an infant under six months old, and prior to the return of menses—LAM has an efficacy rate exceeding 98%[79]. Life table pregnancy rates for correct LAM users range from 0.45% to 2.45% at six months, based on controlled follow-up studies (such as Díaz 1988a with 236 Chilean women, and Cooney 1996 with 419 Rwandan couples)[83]. The pre-modern empirical observation that "menstrual blood was diverted to the breasts to become milk" was an anatomically incorrect heuristic, but functionally highly accurate for predicting the endocrinological suppression of the ovarian cycle by lactation[5].

The Great Errors: Uterine Suffocation and the "Cold" Female

Conversely, pre-modern medicine committed profound errors when it allowed cultural bias and metaphysical teleology to override anatomical reality. The most persistent error was the concept of the "wandering womb" or "uterine suffocation" (hysteria)[5]. Originating in the Hippocratic corpus and perpetuated through Avicenna's *Canon*, this theory posited that a lack of sexual intercourse or retained menses caused the uterus to dry out, detach from its moorings, and migrate upward through the body[5]. This migration supposedly compressed the diaphragm, causing anxiety, breathlessness, and fainting[5].
Physiologically, this is impossible due to the robust ligamentous support of the uterus. The symptoms attributed to the wandering womb were likely a combination of anxiety disorders, hyperventilation, epilepsy, and the somatic expression of psychological distress (the behavioural layer)[67]. However, patriarchal medical culture weaponized this diagnosis to enforce female submission to continuous reproductive labour, prescribing marriage, pregnancy, and frequent intercourse as the only medical cures[50].

Similarly, the Aristotelian and Galenic assertion that women were biologically "colder" than men was an extrapolation of cultural hierarchy onto physiology[14]. While modern measurable averages show adult males have a slightly higher basal metabolic rate (BMR) and body temperature due to greater lean muscle mass, this minor metabolic variance was blown vastly out of proportion by ancient physicians to justify women's supposed intellectual, physical, and generative inferiority[14].

Evaluating Averages vs. Individuals

A critical failure of pre-modern medical models—and a persistent pitfall in modern sociological discourse—is the failure to distinguish between statistical averages and individual variance. At the physiological layer, certain variables are largely binary (e.g., the production of large gametes/ova versus small gametes/sperm). However, most physiological markers (such as hormone levels, bone density, and BMR) and nearly all behavioural markers (such as aggression, spatial reasoning, empathy, and sexual desire) exist on overlapping normal distributions (bell curves).

Pre-modern systems like Aristotelian hylomorphism engaged in typological thinking. They created a Platonic ideal of "Male" (hot, active, rational, formal) and "Female" (cold, passive, emotional, material), treating any deviation from this ideal as a pathological error of nature[8]. However, astute observers consistently noted the inadequacy of these strict typologies. Hildegard of Bingen's detailed description of the "phlegmatic man" and the varied sexual drives of the "choleric" or "sanguine" temperaments demonstrates a medieval recognition of overlapping distributions that defied strict binary categorization[58]. Similarly, Ayurveda's *Prakriti* system explicitly recognizes that an individual's constitution is a unique mosaic of energies, regardless of sex, allowing for highly individualized treatment plans rather than blanket prescriptions based solely on gender[32].

To live and work together effectively, modern organizations and societies must recognize that while robust statistical differences exist in the aggregate averages between sexes, these averages cannot be reliably used to predict the behaviour, competence, or temperament of any specific individual.

Summary of Robust Findings

1. Historiographical consensus rejects Laqueur's "one-sex model"; pre-modern medicine consistently recognized deep, incommensurable physiological differences between the sexes across antiquity and the Middle Ages.
2. Radical skeletal and anatomical dimorphism was firmly established in European medical illustrations by 1600 (e.g., Platter, Bauhin), driven by empirical observation rather than 18th-century Enlightenment politics.
3. The Hippocratic observation of female flesh requiring regular menses correctly identified the physiological necessity of the endometrial cycle for systemic homeostasis, despite incorrect humoral reasoning.
4. Medieval empirical medicine, notably Trota of Salerno's *De curis mulierum*, correctly identified male-factor infertility, challenging Aristotelian dogmas of absolute male generative perfection.

5. Pre-modern observations of premenstrual behavioural shifts are validated by modern meta-analyses showing a 47.8% global prevalence of PMS, rooted in luteal-phase neuroendocrinology.
6. Ancient heuristic observations of lactation preventing pregnancy are strictly validated by Cochrane reviews of the Lactational Amenorrhea Method (LAM), showing >98% efficacy when practiced correctly.
7. TCM correctly identified the massive physiological toll of menstruation and childbirth, establishing gynecology (*fuke*) as a unique discipline with effective pharmacological interventions like *Si Wu Tang* for dysmenorrhea.
8. Ayurveda's *Prakriti* typologies map onto genuine human biological variance, validated today by Ayurgenomics (e.g., CYP2C19 variants and EGLN1 gene expression).
9. The "wandering womb" (hysteria) was an anatomical impossibility weaponized culturally to enforce reproductive compliance and pathologize female anxiety.
10. Pre-modern medicine's greatest error was typological thinking: treating overlapping statistical averages (like slightly lower female BMR) as evidence of absolute, categorical inferiority.

Contested or Open Questions

- To what extent did the suppression of female medical practitioners in the late Middle Ages delay the abandonment of anatomically impossible theories like the "wandering womb"?
- How can modern precision medicine fully decouple the accurate empirical observations of TCM and Ayurveda from their culturally specific metaphysical frameworks without losing the holistic clinical benefit?
- Given the massive variance in PMS prevalence across cultures (12% in France to 98% in Iran), how much of the reported distress of hormonal fluctuation is purely neuroendocrine, and how much is a culturally conditioned nocebo effect?
- How exactly did the Arabic transmission of Galenic texts permanently alter the trajectory of European obstetric surgery prior to the Renaissance anatomical revolution?
- How can modern occupational health frameworks accommodate the biological realities of the female reproductive cycle (as observed in *Rajaswala Paricharya*) without inadvertently reinforcing historical prejudices regarding female frailty?

Important Sources to Read in Full

1. **Cadden, Joan (1993).** *Meanings of Sex Difference in the Middle Ages: Medicine, Science, and Culture.* Cambridge University Press.
2. **Direkvand-Moghadam, A., et al. (2014).** "Epidemiology of Premenstrual Syndrome (PMS)-A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis Study." *Journal of Clinical and Diagnostic Research*, 8(2), 106-109.
3. **Green, Monica H. (2002).** *The Trotula: An English Translation of the Medieval Compendium of Women's Medicine.* University of Pennsylvania Press.
4. **King, Helen (2013).** *The One-Sex Body on Trial: The Classical and Early Modern Evidence.* Ashgate.
5. **Laqueur, Thomas (1990).** *Making Sex: Body and Gender from the Greeks to Freud.*

Harvard University Press.
6. **Park, Katharine & Nye, Robert A. (1991).** "Destiny is Anatomy." *The New Republic*, February 18, 53-57.
7. **Prasher, B., et al. (2008).** "Whole genome expression and biochemical correlates of extreme constitutional types defined in Ayurveda." *Journal of Translational Medicine*, 6(1), 48.
8. **Stolberg, Michael (2003).** "A Woman Down to Her Bones: The Anatomy of Sexual Difference in the Sixteenth and Early Seventeenth Centuries." *Isis*, 94(2), 274-299.
9. **Van der Wijden, C., et al. (2003).** "Lactational amenorrhea for family planning." *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*.
10. **Aristotle (trans. Arthur Platt).** *On the Generation of Animals*.

Implications for Living Together

An analysis of pre-modern medicine yields profound lessons for how men and women can best live and work together in couples, families, and organizations. The primary implication is the absolute necessity of recognizing biological reality without committing the naturalistic fallacy—the erroneous belief that because a behaviour or trait is "natural," it is therefore morally "good," immutable, or socially prescriptive.

The historical record proves that physiological sex differences—from the energetic costs of the menstrual cycle to the endocrinological realities of postpartum lactation and shifting neurochemistry—are not mere social constructs. Organizations and families function best when they accommodate these physiological realities rather than ignoring them in the name of a false, frictionless equality. For instance, expecting complete day-to-day behavioural and energetic uniformity from individuals experiencing significant cyclical hormonal fluctuations is biologically unreasonable. Accommodating the realities of reproductive biology, as the Ayurvedic *Rajaswala Paricharya* attempted to do through rest and dietary support, promotes long-term health and interpersonal stability.

However, the catastrophic error of pre-modern medicine was weaponizing these biological averages to enforce rigid social roles. Just because the average male has higher vital heat (basal metabolic rate), or the average female has higher reproductive caloric demands, does not dictate that a specific woman is unsuited for intellectual leadership or a specific man unsuited for domestic nurturing. By explicitly separating the three layers—acknowledging the absolute realities of *physiology*, respecting the variance of statistical *behaviour*, and consciously designing an equitable *culture*—modern societies can accommodate the realities of sex difference while maximizing the freedom, competence, and potential of every individual.

Works cited

1. Motherhood and Health in the Hippocratic Corpus, https://books.openedition.org/editionsehess/2986
2. Motherhood and Health in the Hippocratic Corpus, https://books.openedition.org/editionsehess/2986?lang=en
3. metaphors and body concepts in Mesopotamian gynaecological texts, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC3791376/

4. What are 'women' in ancient gynaecology, https://oro.open.ac.uk/28098/1/Mathematics_of_Sex.pdf
5. Health, Conduct, and Knowledge (III) - Women and Medieval, https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/women-and-medieval-literary-culture/health-conduct-and-knowledge/08527B3E8CC3B0CB4DF660E0DF35FFED
6. Hippocratic Recipes: Oral and Written Transmission ... - dokumen.pub, https://dokumen.pub/hippocratic-recipes-oral-and-written-transmission-of-pharmacological-knowledge-in-fifth-and-fourth-century-greece-9004171541-9789004171541.html
7. Hippocratic Recipes Oral and Written Transmission of ... - Scribd, https://www.scribd.com/document/656753732/29410529
8. On The Generation Of Animals Chapter Summary | Aristotle - Bookey, https://www.bookey.app/book/on-the-generation-of-animals
9. Aristotle's Physics-Mariska Leunissen | PDF - Scribd, https://www.scribd.com/document/685330466/Aristotle-s-Physics-Mariska-Leunissen
10. A Comparative Study of Aristotle's Philosophy and Manusmriti on, https://ijsser.org/2024files/ijsser_09__127.pdf
11. Form and Matter, http://employees.oneonta.edu/farberas/arth/arth213/form_matter.html
12. On the Generation of Animals - Documenta Catholica Omnia, https://www.documentacatholicaomnia.eu/03d/-384_-322,_Aristoteles,_12_On_the_Generation_of_Animals,_EN.pdf
13. Hildegard of Bingen's Embryology: Enabling Women's Reproductive, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC11855046/
14. On the Generation of Animals/Book IV - Wikisource, https://en.wikisource.org/wiki/On_the_Generation_of_Animals/Book_IV
15. twins as monsters: albertus magnus's theory of the generation of, https://jeremy-brown-vpk4.squarespace.com/s/Albertus-Magnuss-theory-of-twins-1987.pdf
16. On the Generation of Animals/Book II - Wikisource, https://en.wikisource.org/wiki/On_the_Generation_of_Animals/Book_II
17. Female Sexuality in The Early Medieval Islamic World - Scribd, https://www.scribd.com/document/678023163/The-Early-and-Medieval-Islamic-World-Pernilla-Myrne-Female-Sexuality-in-the-Early-Medieval-Islamic-World-Gender-and-Sex-in-Arabic-Literature-I-B
18. Bodily Fluids in Antiquity 1138343722, 9781138343726, https://dokumen.pub/bodily-fluids-in-antiquity-1138343722-9781138343726.html
19. Generation and Degeneration: Tropes of Reproduction in Literature, https://dokumen.pub/generation-and-degeneration-tropes-of-reproduction-in-literature-and-history-from-antiquity-through-early-modern-europe-9780822380276.html
20. Gender Models - Seksediversiteit.nl, https://www.seksediversiteit.nl/en/woordenlijst/sekse-modellen/
21. One-sex and two-sex theories - Wikipedia, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/One-sex_and_two-sex_theories

22. The Myth of the “One-Sex” Body, https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/pdfplus/10.1086/723726
23. Let Go of Laqueur: Towards New Histories of the Sexed Body, https://www.peren-revues.fr/eugesta/index.php?id=356
24. Erecting Sex: Hermaphrodites and the Medieval Science of Surgery, https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/10.1086/682954
25. female embodiment and the ascetic impulse: in search of a theology, https://doras.dcu.ie/23687/2/190822%20Alyson%20Staunton%2014112621.pdf
26. Helen King - The One-Sex Body On Trial - The Classical and Early, https://www.scribd.com/document/726982664/Helen-King-The-One-Sex-Body-on-Trial-The-Classical-and-Early-Modern-Evidence-Routledge-2013
27. A woman down to her bones. The anatomy of sexual difference in, https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/12879558/
28. A Woman Down to Her Bones The Anatomy of Sexual Difference in, https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/abs/10.1086/379387
29. Isis | Vol 94, No 2 - The University of Chicago Press: Journals, https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/toc/isis/2003/94/2
30. Sex in the Flesh - ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/10645084_Sex_in_the_Flesh
31. (PDF) Role of Rajaswala Paricharya on Artavadushti w.s.r to, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/386198951_Role_of_Rajaswala_Paricharya_on_Artavadushti_wsr_to_Menstrual_Disorders-_A_Holistic_Approach
32. Ayurgenomics and Modern Medicine - PMC - NIH, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC7760374/
33. An Ayurgenomics Approach: Prakriti-Based Drug Discovery and, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC9011054/
34. A scoping review of clinical Āyurgenomics studies incorporating, https://www.frontiersin.org/journals/medicine/articles/10.3389/fmed.2026.1894441/full
35. Recapitulation of Ayurveda constitution types by machine learning of, https://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0185380
36. Women's Sacred Monthly Cycle: Awakening to Its Life-Giving Power, https://keralaayurveda.store/blogs/news/womens-sacred-monthly-cycle-awakening-to-its-life-giving-power
37. Article - Journal of Ayurveda and Holistic Medicine (JAHM), https://jahm.co.in/index.php/jahm/article/download/1151/817/2737
38. A way forward in managing oligo-hypomenorrhoea (Artavakshaya), https://www.ayurvedjournal.com/JAHM_202174_06.pdf
39. RAJASWALA PARICHARYA AND MENSTRUAL HEALTH, https://eprajournals.com/IJMR/article/17364/download
40. Scientific Validation of Rajaswala Paricharya - JETIR.org, https://www.jetir.org/papers/JETIRFL06009.pdf
41. Ayurgenomics-based frameworks in precision and integrative, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/cambridge-prisms-precision-medicine/article/ayurgenomicsbased-frameworks-in-precision-and-integrative-medicine-translat

ional-opportunities/BF4B2907B07A00B57437D2D44E33B843
42. Ayurgenomics- TRISUTRA - Indian CST, https://indiancst.in/skins/default//docs1/reports/Ayurgenomics%20Write%20up.pdf
43. Personalized Medicine through Prakriti: Exploring Ayurgenomics as, https://ijrti.org/papers/IJRTI2506133.pdf
44. Original Research Paper Anupama V Chinnikatti Sharad Kumar M, https://www.worldwidejournals.com/global-journal-for-research-analysis-GJRA/recent_issues_pdf/2026/July/ayurgenomics-bridging-ayurvedic-constitutional-biology-with-multiomics-and-precision-medicinea-narrative-review_July_2026_4895711357_7109374.pdf
45. Medicine for Womwn in Ancient China - pdfcoffee.com, https://pdfcoffee.com/medicine-for-womwn-in-ancient-china-pdf-free.html
46. Reproducing Women: Medicine, Metaphor, and Childbirth in Late, https://dokumen.pub/reproducing-women-medicine-metaphor-and-childbirth-in-late-imperial-china-9780520947610.html
47. A Randomised Placebo-Controlled Trial of a Traditional Chinese, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/6130070_A_Randomised_Placebo-Controlled_Trial_of_a_Traditional_Chinese_Herbal_Formula_in_the_Treatment_of_Primary_Dysmenorrhoea
48. Chinese herbal medicine for primary dysmenorrhoea - PMC - NIH, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC12536932/
49. The Trotula: A Medieval Compendium of Women's Medicine (review), https://www.researchgate.net/publication/236782927_The_Trotula_A_Medieval_Compendium_of_Women's_Medicine_review
50. Embracing the Body and the Soul (Chapter 7) - Women and, https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/women-and-medieval-literary-culture/embracing-the-body-and-the-soul/3CF1D219A76A1D642DA97AEC7EED0429
51. 02.07.20, Green, ed. and Trans., The Trotula | The Medieval Review, https://scholarworks.iu.edu/journals/index.php/tmr/article/view/15253
52. Old Recipes, New Practice? The Latin Adaptations of the ... - PMC, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC3063955/
53. Women's Healthcare in the Medieval West (Variorum Collected, https://dokumen.pub/womens-healthcare-in-the-medieval-west-variorum-collected-studies-series-0860788261-9780860788263.html
54. Trotula of Salerno - King's College, https://departments.kings.edu/womens_history/trotula.html
55. Physical and Spiritual Health in Hildegard of Bingen's Causae et curae, https://www.academia.edu/35130132/The_Mistress_and_the_Handmaid_Physical_and_Spiritual_Health_in_Hildegard_of_Bingens_Causae_et_curae
56. Hildegard of Bingen, https://shethoughtit.ilcml.com/biography/hildegard-of-bingen/
57. The life and medicine of Saint Hildegard of Bingen, https://hekint.org/2021/03/05/body-and-soul-balance-and-the-sibyl-of-the-rhine-the-life-and-medicine-of-saint-hildegard-of-bingen/
58. appreciation for men's sexuality in Hildegard's Causae et curae, https://www.purplemotes.net/2015/02/01/men-hildegard-causae-et-curae/

59. Intersex Between Sex And Gender In Cause Et Cure, https://www.repository.cam.ac.uk/bitstreams/4a9fc9f7-7c9f-492b-90d7-f857788b5db6/download
60. Intersex Between Sex And Gender In Cause Et Cure - Taylor & Francis, https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/10412573.2021.1991720
61. Generation Reborn and Reformed (Part II) - Reproduction, https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/reproduction/generation-reborn-and-reformed/03E27D7D1AC4769EC8C2EBE2C143FE21
62. Interpretation of Avicenna's (980–1037 AD) treatise in the Canon of, https://tibb.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2024/11/The-genitourinary-and-reproductive-systems-avicenna.pdf
63. The Canon of Medicine | Islam Wiki - Fandom, https://islam.fandom.com/wiki/The_Canon_of_Medicine
64. Generation in Medieval Islamic Medicine (Chapter 9) - Reproduction, https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/reproduction/generation-in-medieval-islamic-medicine/35918CB42373D55CAD585491AF2A30BA
65. The Construction of Sexual Knowledge in Egypt, 1827-1928, https://search.proquest.com/openview/645f9823c1312f093ee27fc209345dac/1.pdf?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=51922&diss=y
66. WILLIAM OF SALICETO ON HUMAN SEXUALITY - Brepols Online, https://www.brepolsonline.net/doi/pdf/10.1484/J.VIATOR.2.301485
67. Women And Hysteria In The History Of Mental Health - PMC - NIH, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC3480686/
68. Galen - Wikipedia, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Galen
69. Contributions of Ibn al-Nafis to the Progress of Medicine and Urology, https://muslimheritage.com/contributions-of-ibn-al-nafis/
70. Prevalence of premenstrual syndrome and its associated factors in, https://www.frontiersin.org/journals/psychiatry/articles/10.3389/fpsyt.2024.1338304/full
71. Sex During Menstruation: Race, Sexual Identity, and Women's, https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK565670/
72. On the Interplay Between the Medicine of Hildegard of Bingen and, https://www.frontiersin.org/journals/neuroscience/articles/10.3389/fnins.2022.745138/full
73. Epidemiology of Premenstrual Syndrome, A Systematic Review and, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/261375646_Epidemiology_of_Premenstrual_Syndrome_A_Systematic_Review_and_Meta-Analysis_Study
74. Epidemiology of Premenstrual Syndrome (PMS)-A Systematic ... - PMC, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC3972521/
75. Epidemiology of Premenstrual Syndrome (PMS) - PubMed, https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/24701496/
76. Premenstrual Syndrome Is Associated With a Higher Frequency of, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/314982496_Premenstrual_Syndrome_Is_Associated_With_a_Higher_Frequency_of_Female_Sexual_Difficulty_and_Sexual_Distress

77. Premenstrual Syndrome and Female Sexual Function - ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/347610402_Premenstrual_Syndrome_and_Female_Sexual_Function
78. Medicine in the medieval Islamic world - Wikipedia, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Medicine_in_the_medieval_Islamic_world
79. Assessing the Knowledge, Attitude and Practice of Lactational ... - OER, https://oer.tsuniversity.edu.ng/index.php/jjsms/article/download/607/561/2377
80. Knowledge and use of lactational amenorrhoea as a family planning, https://bmjopen.bmj.com/content/bmjopen/12/2/e054609.full.pdf
81. Knowledge and practices of lactational amenorrhea among urban, https://www.ovid.com/journals/jimph/pdf/10.4103/jimph.jimph_15_24~knowledge-and-practices-of-lactational-amenorrhea-among
82. Effectiveness of Lactational Amenorrhea Method in Ethiopia: A Multi, https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.2147/OAJC.S425574
83. A Systematic Review of the Lactational Amenorrhea Method, https://www.factsaboutfertility.org/a-systematic-review-of-the-lactational-amenorrhea-method/
84. Lactational amenorrhea for family planning | Request PDF, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/9035822_Lactational_amenorrhea_for_family_planning
85. Lactational amenorrhoea method for family planning - PMC - NIH, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC6823189/